
DUBLIN – ICANN Regular Board Meeting
Thursday, October 22, 2015 – 17:30 to 19:00 IST
ICANN54 | Dublin, Ireland

STEVE CROCKER: All right. Thank you all. I think we still have some board members who are arriving. Good.

Call to order the ICANN board of directors, and we'll start with an official roll call.

Let me ask from my left all the way down the table here. Ray?

I see. Okay. I'll help out then.

We have Ray Plzak, Kuo-Wei Wu, Thomas Schneider --

UNKNOWN SPEAKER: (Off microphone.)

STEVE CROCKER: Some -- this one is.

UNKNOWN SPEAKER: (Off microphone.)

Note: The following is the output resulting from transcribing an audio file into a word/text document. Although the transcription is largely accurate, in some cases may be incomplete or inaccurate due to inaudible passages and grammatical corrections. It is posted as an aid to the original audio file, but should not be treated as an authoritative record.

STEVE CROCKER: No, it's worse than that. My mic isn't working. I had to borrow this from Bruce. There's some technical problem that's being sorted out behind.

Yeah, Thomas Schneider, Cherine Chalaby.

GEORGE SADOWSKY: George Sadowsky. Mine's working.

ASHA HEMRAJANI: Asha Hemrajani.

WOLFGANG KLEINWACHTER: Wolfgang Kleinwachter.

STEVE CROCKER: Steve Crocker.

BRUCE TONKIN: Bruce Tonkin.

JONNE SOININEN: Jonne Soininen.

ERIKA MANN: Erika Mann.

MARKUS KUMMER: Markus Kummer.

BRUNO LANVIN: Bruno Lanvin.

GONZALO NAVARRO: Gonzalo Navarro.

RINALIA ABDUL RAHIM: Rinalia Abdul Rahim.

CHRIS DISSPAIN: Chris Disspain.

MIKE SILBER: Mike Silber.

FADI CHEHADE: Fadi Chehade.

STEVE CROCKER: Thank you, all.

RAM MOHAN: And Ram Mohan on the phone.

STEVE CROCKER: Thank you, Ram. Thank you.

Mr. Secretary, we have a quorum?

He signals that we do. Thank you.

The first item on the agenda is an omnibus of items to be passed by consent.

Approval of the minutes of 28 September.

Delegation of IDN ccTLD epsilon lambda representing Greece in the Greek script.

Delegation of IDN -- which I can't pronounce this but Cherine can you pronounce this for me?

CHERINE CHALABY: If my mic works. (non-English word or phrase).

STEVE CROCKER: Thank you. Representing Iraq in Arabic script.

GNSO gTLD -- no. We've taken -- that's obsolete. We've taken that off and moved it.

Approval of contracting disbursement for CRM platform enhancement.

And thank you to community members, all of which --

Oh, thank you to the local hosts and the sponsors and to the interpreters, staff, event, and hotel teams.

Do I have positive votes, affirmative votes, from everybody?

Say aye.

[Affirmative responses]

STEVE CROCKER:

Any dissent? Any -- any opposed?

[No response]

Any abstentions?

[No response]

Thank you. So the consent agenda passes unanimously.

And with that, I'd like to mention that we have -- in the thank you to the community members, we recognized everybody earlier at the beginning of the -- just prior to the public forum, and a very stellar set of people who have done an enormous amount of work over time.

We now move to the main agenda.

The first item is a thank you to the 2015 nominating committee.
And -- excuse me a second.

Chris?

CHRIS DISSPAIN: Yes.

STEVE CROCKER: Would you like to move this?

CHRIS DISSPAIN: Yes.

STEVE CROCKER: Wolfgang?

WOLFGANG KLEINWACHTER: Yeah. I second.

STEVE CROCKER: Thank you. Stephane?

Let me call Stephane Van Gelder to the stage for a brief set of remarks and a short, very crisp, PowerPoint presentation.

STEPHANE VAN GELDER: Thank you, Steve. I don't know -- this is working, right? Yeah.

Thank you, Steve. Thank you, all.

We just wanted to, in the spirit of continuing openness and transparency that the NomCom has embarked upon for the last few years, give you a very short overview of the work that was accomplished in 2015.

There is a presentation that's planned. I don't know if it's working or not.

So not seeing the presentation, I will just work through it as if it was there and try and describe it for you.

I just wanted to remind you of the leadership positions that we were recruiting to for this year.

Three seats of the -- three seats on the ICANN board of directors, two seats on the GNSO Council. And those were two voting seats. The nominating committee also directed each seat to the house. Thank you. Is this working? Yeah.

And the nominating committee also chose which house the two nominating -- the two people that were selected would go to.

We also selected three seats on the At-Large Advisory Committee and you can see the term lengths there on the

presentation and the geographic diversity and the regions that we were recruiting to. And one seat on the GNSO Council.

I wanted to give you a breakdown of the applications that we'd received and draw particular attention to the last sentence, which is that out of the 81 completed applications that we received, 12 -- only 12 -- much to our regret, were women. You can see the breakdown of the other -- the different groups and the people that applied to each group, so I won't labor that, but I did want to stress that we did receive a low number of women applicants, and despite that, as I go through our selectees, you will see that we managed to put women in these positions at each group that we were recruiting to.

So we are very happy about that. And one of the recommendations that we've set for ourselves going forwards to the next cycle is that we must do all we can to encourage more women to participate in this process and to try and understand why that is difficult, or apparently difficult, for women. What are we doing wrong as a community that makes women feel they cannot participate as actively as men can.

So for the board, I want to recognize our three selectees, Rafael, Lousewies, and George.

Then for the ALAC, Timothy, Kaili Kan, Wafa, and Leon. Some of these people obviously you know and others are new and

incoming, but I do want to make sure that everyone has a -- at least an idea of who they are so that you can make them feel as welcome as possible.

For the GNSO, Johan and Valerie.

And for the ccNSO, Christelle. I also just wanted to let you know some of the work that was undertaken by the nominating committee this year in its drive towards constantly improving its processes and making sure that what we do is as open, as transparent as possible, with the overarching guideline that we always impose on ourselves, which is that although our processes are as open as they can be, for obvious reasons all the candidate information is kept confidential.

The process would be difficult to run if we weren't confidential about those that applied to the nominating committee.

So for this year, what we did that was relatively new, we created a whistle-blower email so that anyone that has an issue with, say, a potential conflict of interest can report that in a way that doesn't go just to the nominating committee leadership but to an independent place that is managed by our support staff and that can allow anybody to declare a possible problem.

We also tried to build greater interaction with the Board Governance Committee, which is a committee on the board that

looks after us, and we feel it's very important, as we work to complete these leadership selection tasks, that we have a greater understanding of what the board and the BGC want from us, and that they have a greater understanding of what our possible issues or parameters are in doing this work. So that we felt that just seeing them or talking to them once per cycle wasn't enough, so that going forward we will try to continue to talk more often.

Two of the things that I want to draw your attention to as well is that the NomCom is reviewed, as I'm sure many of you know. The leadership team is reviewed by an external firm, and that is at the BGC's request, and that was instituted in 2012, I believe.

This year -- so only the chair and the chair-elect were reviewed.

This year, we suggested that the third leadership position was -- which is the associate chair, also be reviewed, so that was done.

And all three leader -- members of the leadership team committed at the start to publishing those reviews.

We also reviewed the members this year, and that was an internal review process but I think it's very important to highlight that all members of the nominating committee committed to not only being reviewed but having those reviews published, so that their sending organizations know -- or have

an idea of how their peers felt that they had performed during the cycle.

And I think as far as I know, the NomCom is the only body to do this. It's possibly something that other groups in the ICANN community might want to think about doing as well. Certainly it's something that we feel is useful.

The last thing I wanted to inform you of is that we created subcommittees to look at specific areas of the NomCom work, so conflicts of interest, outreach, statement of interest revisions, so that the application process runs as smoothly as possible and is as easy as it can be. Transparency, which is part of what I'm doing now also, which is outreach to the community and the wider world, making sure that everyone knows how the NomCom works, how it functions, and also alternates, which is specific cases when we select a person for a particular seat. If that person isn't able, for whatever reason, to take that seat, then we have to manage an alternate situation and that's something that we looked at as well.

Some links. As I suppose these slides will be available as part of the meeting Web site, I included some links for people who want to know more about the NomCom and the NomCom's application process, and also just a list of all the members of the 2015 committee -- nominating committee and just to say a big

thank you to all the members of that committee and specifically to my comembers of the leadership team, Ron Andruff and Cheryl Langdon-Orr.

Thank you very much.

[Applause]

STEVE CROCKER:

Thank you very much, Stephane.

The resolution lists each of the members of the nominating committee and resolves that they have earned the deep appreciation of the board of directors for the terms of service and that the board of directors wishes them well in their future endeavors within the ICANN community and beyond.

Is there any further discussion?

I call for the vote.

All in favor say aye.

[Affirmative responses]

Any opposed?

[No response]

Any abstentions?

[No response]

The motion passes unanimously. Thank you very much.

The next is the gTLD -- GNSO gTLD registry stakeholder group charter amendments.

BRUCE TONKIN: Steve, can I just make a comment?

STEVE CROCKER: Yeah.

BRUCE TONKIN: It just sort of might be worth mentioning, Stephane referred to the 360-degree review process for nominating committee members. I just wanted to point out that we also have a process in the board that's very similar. So each board member gets reviewed through a 360-degree process. And we also do a review of the whole board for performance at regular intervals.

One of the challenges with 360-degree reviews -- and I note the nominating committee has published theirs -- is often that you kind of want to have almost direct feedback from members of the group so that they feel free to give you quite personal feedback, in many cases, and then the question is, you know, should we or should we not publish that. And that's one of the

challenges of it. If you publish a lot of material, people start to wind back their comments and they become very generic. You don't publish it and then you have the concern about transparency, but that feedback is probably more directly useful by the board members. That's one of the challenges that we have. But we're also doing 360-degree reviews and have done so for some years.

STEVE CROCKER: Thank you, Bruce.

So moving on to Item 2(b), the GNSO gTLD registry stakeholder group charter amendments, do I have somebody to move this?

RINALIA ABDUL RAHIM: I move.

STEVE CROCKER: Thank you, Rinalia. And a second?

RAY PLZAK: Second.

STEVE CROCKER: Thank you, Ray.

Would you like to -- so I should -- I should read the --

RINALIA ABDUL RAHIM: Steve?

STEVE CROCKER: Yeah.

RINALIA ABDUL RAHIM: I would like to make a comment.

STEVE CROCKER: Please do.

RINALIA ABDUL RAHIM: Thank you.

Folks, lend me your ears.

I would like to highlight some important points about the decision before the board regarding the GNSO gTLD registry stakeholder group charter amendment.

Organizational charters are important governance and accountability documents. They codify an organization's purpose, structure, scope, and the allocation of responsibility, together with the requisite accompanying accountability.

It is from this that the rules to govern by and the mechanisms for accountability are developed for organizations within ICANN.

The charters serve as a concrete and tangible anchor for discussions on structural changes, as well as on organizational -- as well as on enhancing organizational accountability.

Now, discussions on these topics are happening now in the context of ICANN's current organizational architecture, as well as in the context of enhancing SO/AC accountability as it relates to the work of the cross-community working group on enhancing ICANN accountability.

Now, everyone should take note that ICANN actually has an established process for changing organizational charters. Members of the ICANN community interested in initiating any changes for their organization, including, but not limited to, matters of structure, allocation of governance functions, and enhancement of accountability mechanisms are invited to take note of this process.

The process involves certain steps to be taken before the formal adoption of such charter changes.

In brief, the steps involve discussion and preparation of the amendments by the affected parties, and this requires

agreement or consensus as per internal processes of those affected parties.

It also involves staff review, public comments, and the review of the organizational effectiveness committee. And for those who didn't get the memo, this was formerly known as the structural improvements committee.

And also, finally, it involves board review and approval.

In the case of the GNSO gTLD registry stakeholder group charter amendments, the organizational effectiveness committee has reviewed the charter amendments. We have evaluated their consistency with ICANN principles as well as potential fiscal and liability concerns and risks.

We confirm that all necessary steps of the process for changing organizational charters have been satisfied, and we noted that in the public comments there was qualified community support for the -- for the amendments.

The committee has adopted a formal resolution on this matter and we recommend board approval of the amendments.

In addition in light of the public comments received, we also recommend that the board encourages the Registry Stakeholder Group to take a more holistic view of its governance document and to examine additional issues raised by the commenters,

specifically for the stakeholder group to consider a broader examination of the weighted voting, membership and structural matters regarding the operations of the stakeholder group, which we believe would result in a stronger and more effective organization. Thank you.

The resolution reads: Resolved, that the ICANN board approves the gTLD Registry Stakeholder Group charter amendments with encouragement to the Registry Stakeholder Group to consider a broader examination of the weighted voting, membership, and structural matters regarding the operations of the stakeholder group. ICANN staff should inform the Registry Stakeholder Group leadership of this resolution and work with the Registry Stakeholder Group to ensure it provides access to the new governing document on the appropriate Registry Stakeholder Group Web pages.

Thank you, Steve.

STEVE CROCKER:

Thank you very much, Rinalia.

Discussion from anybody else? Thank you. I'll call -- oh, I'm sorry.

ERIKA MANN: Not really a discussion. But can somebody tell me which page this one you were talking about. I was trying to find it.

CHRIS DISSPAIN: Page 13 -- no, sorry. 17. 17, Erika.

STEVE CROCKER: Did you want to go into -- okay.

ERIKA MANN: That's correct. It's the last part of 17. Thanks.

STEVE CROCKER: Okay. I'll call for the vote. All those in favor say aye.

[Chorus of Ayes.]

Any opposed?

[No verbal response]

Any abstentions?

[No verbal response]

The motion carries. Thank you very much.

We move on to Item 2C on the agenda, decommissioning of the New gTLD Program Committee, GNSO gTLDs.

Do I have a motion? Cherine, thank you very much. A second?
Asha, thank you very much.

Cherine, would you like to speak to this?

CHERINE CHALABY:

Yes, please. In April 2012, the board established a New gTLD Program Committee to undertake an oversight of the whole new gTLD program. The reason we established the committee at that time are two. The first one is to ensure that all conflicted board members vis-a-vis the program were not part of the committee. And the second reason was more efficient way of executing the program as there was a very large volume of work to be done. In fact, during the last 3 1/2 years, we had over 60 new gTLD committee meetings and over, I think, 112 resolutions. That's quite a substantial amount.

Those reasons have now gone. And it's time to decommission the new gTLD program. That doesn't mean that the work on the program itself will cease, not at all. It will just move to the whole board, and the board will continue to perform that oversight.

So I wanted to say in closing thank you to everyone that participated in the new gTLD. In particular I want to thank staff for their immense effort and work. And I want to thank everyone on the board. The credit goes to everyone including, of course,

the community and all the advice we got. So thank you very much.

And we really owe ourselves a round of applause to a very, very large undertaking there. Thank you very much.

[Applause]

STEVE CROCKER:

Thank you. Let me read the Resolved portion of the resolution. It's very straightforward, two parts: Resolved, the ICANN board New gTLD Program Committee is hereby decommissioned.

And Resolved, the board wishes to acknowledge and thank the NGPC Chair and all of its members for the considerable energy, time, and skills that members of the NGPC brought to the oversight of the 2012 round of the new gTLD program.

Any other comments? Any other discussion?

BRUCE TONKIN:

Just a comment really. I think it's perhaps worth recognizing the fact that the chair of that committee, Cherine Chalaby, was also chairing the Finance Committee at the same time. So it's a fairly heavy workload sustained over a number of years. I just wanted to call that out and thank him for his work chairing that committee.

STEVE CROCKER: Thank you. Any other discussion? Let me call for the vote. All those in favor say aye.

[Chorus of Ayes.]

Any opposed?

[No verbal response.]

Any abstentions?

[No verbal response.]

The New gTLD Program Committee is now old and gone.

[Applause]

It's a major milestone.

Item 2D, consideration of the independent review panel's final declaration in Vistaprint versus ICANN.

Do I have -- Bruno, thank you. A second? Asha, thank you very much.

Bruno -- well, and let me note that in this case, both George and Ram recuse themselves from the discussion and the vote on this.

Bruno, would you like to introduce this?

BRUNO LANVIN:

This is basically about accepting the panel's advice regarding the -- accepting the advice received from the panel. Should I read out the text?

Resolved, the board accepts the panel's recommendation that ICANN board exercise its judgment on the question of whether -- sorry, we have a different text on the screen. Is that the one I should read? Okay.

Resolved, that the board accepts the following findings of the panel's final declaration that, one, ICANN is the prevailing party in the Vistaprint Limited versus ICANN IRP; two, the board including the Board Governance Committee did not violate the articles, bylaws, or guidebook; three, the relevant policies such as the standards for evaluating string confusion objections do not violate any of ICANN's articles or bylaws reflecting principles such as good faith, fairness, transparency, and accountability; four, the time for challenging the guidebook's standard for evaluating string confusion objections which was developed in an open process and with extensive input has passed; five, the lack of an appeal mechanism to contest the merits of the Vistaprint SCO expert determination is not, in itself, a violation of ICANN's articles or bylaws; six, in the absence of a party's recourse to an accountability mechanism, the ICANN board has

no affirmative duty to review the result in any particular SCO case; and, seven, the IRP costs should be divided between the parties in a 60% to Vistaprint and 40% to ICANN proportion.

Resolved, the board accepts the panel's recommendation that ICANN's board exercise its judgment on the question of whether an additional review mechanism is appropriate to re-evaluate the third expert's determination in the Vistaprint SCO, in view of ICANN's bylaws concerning core values and non-discriminatory treatment, and based on the particular circumstances and developments noted in this declaration -- just waiting for the next page to show -- including, one, the Vistaprint SCO determination involving Vistaprint's .WEBS applications; two, the board's and NGPC's resolutions on singular and plural gTLDs; and, three, the board's decisions to delegate numerous other singular/plural versions of the same gTLD strings. Final declaration, page 70.

The board will consider this recommendation at its next scheduled meeting to the extent it is feasible.

Resolved, the board directs the President and CEO or his designee or designees to ensure that the ongoing reviews of the new gTLD program take into consideration the issues raised by the panel as it relates to SCOs.

STEVE CROCKER:

Thank you. Let me note that this is an IRP decision that has come to us. I believe it's the third in our entire history. The bylaw requirement for obligation for us is that we consider the decision -- the IRP decision if at all possible at the next board meeting. This is the immediately following board meeting. And we have not only taken it up for consideration but accepted and are acting on the provisions here.

Any further discussion?

All in favor say aye?

[Chorus of Ayes.]

Any opposed?

[No verbal response.]

Any abstentions?

[No verbal response.]

We have the two recusals previously noted. Thank you very much. It passes.

And we now move to Item 2E, a thank you to Wolfgang Kleinwachter. Do I have -- thank you. Markus moves it. And a second?

BRUNO LANVIN: I second.

STEVE CROCKER: Thank you very much, Bruno.

Let me call on Bruno to say a few words. And if you don't say enough, I'll say some more.

RINALIA ABDUL RAHIM: You called on Wolfgang.

WOLFGANG KLEINWACHTER: Thank you very much. After two years on the board and 375,624 emails, telephone calls and Skype chats, I have three messages.

Message one is we have to finalize the transition. This is a historic moment. Build bridges. Find consensus. If this window is closed and we did not achieve what we can achieve, this will be a big failure not only for ICANN but for the future of the Internet and for global Internet governance.

Message two is don't stop. If you have finished the transition, if you have finished the accountability, this will go on. You have to face a deep structural reform.

Our structure comes from the year 2002. In 2020, the world will be different. And you have to modernize the structure to make it

more flexible to the needs, more multistakeholder. We are organized mainly in interest groups. And we need a layered system where interest groups and stakeholder groups work better hand in hand. This is a big challenge.

Message 3 is human rights. ICANN is not the content police. Whatever ICANN decides, we have to respect freedom of expression and privacy. And a short message to the board, we should be more open and transparent. We have nothing to hide. There are no secrets. Why not to be more open? There are moments when we have to have a confidential meeting, but this should be the exception and not the rule.

So this is my 50th ICANN meeting, 5-0. Some dances to remember. Some dances to forget. I think veterans know this language. This comes from the famous Eagle song "Hotel California."

And when I arrived at ICANN, I was more or less in the same position like the young guy who came from the highway standing in the sun in front of the hotel and says, Oh, this could be heaven or this could be hell.

And, indeed, you know, this was true, too. It was sometimes heaven and sometimes hell. But we had good dances in the hallways. We make a lot of friends. And we had good wine. But there are also open questions because I still do not know when

the lyric says in the song "And in master's chambers they want to kill the beast," what is the master chambers? And who is the beast in ICANN?

But, anyhow, you know, when the guy then goes to exit, the doorman says, "Okay, you can check out any time you like but you can never leave." So I will check out from the board, but I will not leave. Thank you.

[Applause]

(Standing ovation.)

STEVE CROCKER:

That's a hard act to follow.

[Laughter]

You want to add anything? Nope.

I'll add just a word or two. Wolfgang has done service to this community in multiple ways. He's a deep student and scholar, professor of the subject matter that we practice. He has served as chair of NomCom, and I have watched him both from afar and within. He's deeply committed.

He holds what I expect will be a record for quite some time of serving in the peculiar and unique capacity of finishing the terms. He's sort of our relief pitcher, twice by just a peculiar

coincidence of circumstances. He has plunged right in and made himself enormously useful, even at times of great personal stress. It has been an absolute pleasure from my point of view to know Wolfgang and to work with him. And so on behalf of the board, thank you very much.

WOLFGANG KLEINWACHTER: Thank you.

[Applause]

STEVE CROCKER:

All those in favor?

[Chorus of Ayes.]

Any opposed?

[No verbal response.]

Nobody dares. Any abstentions?

[No verbal response.]

Thank you.

All right. The next is thank you to Gonzalo Navarro. Do I have somebody to move this? Kuo, thank you very much.

A second? Jonne, thank you very much.

Let me call on both Bruce and Jonne in that order.

BRUCE TONKIN:

Thanks, Steve. First I want to ask for a correction to the motion. What we tend to recognize is not just the membership of committees but if a board member has made a special effort to chair a committee, we note that as well. And I note that Gonzalo was Chair of the Global Relationship Committee for about a year and a half, I think. So if we can note in the motion that he was a former chair of that committee.

He has an impressive list of committees here. And I think Gonzalo came to the board certainly with a lot of expertise from a government perspective. But he really contributed to each of our sort of more corporate governance committees such as audit and finance and in the last year, maybe two years, as a member of the Board Governance Committee and has really, I think, made a tremendous contribution to the board.

STEVE CROCKER:

Thank you, Bruce.

We will consider that a friendly amendment and correct the record as it stands.

Jonne?

JONNE SOININEN: Thank you, Steve. I'm going to try my luck and say this in Spanish. Already sorry. I want to apologize for the Spanish-speaking people for what I'm going to do to your language.

I would like to say a few words to Gonzalo. Just like Gonzalo doesn't usually -- he says he doesn't speak too much. But when he speaks at the board or in public, he always says something that is impressive and important. In the three years that I have been working with Gonzalo on the board, I was always impressed at his intelligence, his experience, his great heart. And these are qualities difficult to find in an individual, especially in a lawyer.

I hope that now you will have more time to spend with your family after leaving the board. But I hope that you can use part of your time to continue working with ICANN for the benefit of the Internet community. Thank you so much, Gonzalo.

[Applause]

STEVE CROCKER: We had the great pleasure of working with Gonzalo the time he's been on the Board, which measures now six, years although relatively young compared to us old people. He came with a remarkable amount of experience both in other not-to-be

mentioned organizations like the ITU and also served as the representative to the GAC from Chile. And, as Bruce pointed out, he chaired the Board Global Relationship Committee.

And he's just brought a lot of energy and eagerness as well as the depth of experience. And has always been very humble and gentle but totally engaged.

Do you want to add anything, Gonzalo?

GONZALO NAVARRO:

Sure. Thank you.

Thank you very much for those kind words. Of course, I'm going to deliver this in Spanish. It's tradition. Why not to keep it?

Don't worry. I'm going to be extremely brief. It is difficult to summarize six years of so many experiences in a few minutes. So I was thinking that there is one word that, basically, describes what I've learned over these six years. The reward that I got from working in ICANN. And that is experience.

When you are a child, you want to have experience in life. And you want to do the things that you feel passionate about. You want to be happy and sad at the same time, because that is the idea. And ICANN has given me a lot of joy, but also a lot of sadness. But, actually, my trip here has been really comforting.

And still I entered -- I joined the Board when I was quite young. And over these six years I acquired a lot of experience. I became a better individual, a better professional. And it is impossible not to do that with such talented people and so generous as the Board members, the staff, and, of course, the ICANN community.

In contrast with this experience, I should also say that over these six years, I devoted a lot of energy, effort, time to contribute and also for you to feel that you had a board member that was truly committed to his work. I sacrificed a lot of my family time.

Over these years we faced so many things. During my time on the Board, I went through situations where you mix happiness, sadness, and also when you feel like you're going crazy. But I never lost sight of the goals that I wanted to achieve.

And the truth is that ICANN, as a community and as an organization, has this ability to create problems. But also we have a lot of talent to find extremely creative solutions to these problems.

It was my pleasure to work with you. I am looking for solutions to these problems, and you will always count on me for whatever you need. I wish you a safe trip back home. And thank you.

[Applause]

STEVE CROCKER: Thank you, Gonzalo. I was having trouble with the translation. I think you said you joined the Board when you were young and it made you old.

[Laughter]

Kidding aside, it's been a joy to work with you. And we will miss you from here.

All in favor say aye.

UNKNOWN SPEAKER: Ayes.

STEVE CROCKER: Any opposed? Any abstentions? The motion passes, as we knew it would.

Move onto the third loss that we're going to take this year. A thank you to Ray Plzak. I have a thank you to Kuo-Wei to move it.

RINALIA ABDUL RAHIM: Rinalia to second.

STEVE CROCKER: Rinalia to second. Let me call on Cherine to say a few words.

CHERINE CHALABY: Thank you. I wish I could oppose this motion. We don't want Ray to leave. I have to say he's really, in my mind, irreplaceable. If you look at his career over the last 25 years, the immense contribution he has made to the Internet in general, to the community, to ICANN, we must all be grateful for that.

I'm going to say some of those because they are really big achievements.

So it all began in 1991. And, just anecdotally, it was a year after he retired from the Army. And he had been in the Army 21 years. And guess what? The day after he retired, Saddam Hussein invaded Kuwait. So they were waiting for him to go.

Anyway, so he got involved with Internet registry operation 1991. He then became president and CEO of ARIN from 2000 to 2009. He's a past member of RSSAC. He's A charter member of SSAC. He's been an active member in WSIS and IGF. And he is a principle author and editor of many and several Internet documents, governance documents, including the NRO MoU, the ASO MoU, and the ARIN PDP.

He's also been on the Board since 2009 as the ASO appointee and, with the tradition of mentioning and thanking him for the committees he's served, I'm going to list them.

He -- Ray served on the audit committee, on the governance committee, on the new gTLD committee. He was also the chair of what is known today the organizational effectiveness committee and formerly known as the Structural Improvement Committee. He was on the risk committee. And he was on the Board/GAC recommendation implementation working group.

What an achievement and what a contribution. So, sadly, today we say good-bye to Ray. We say good-bye to a friend, to a man of high integrity, and to an outstanding board member.

We also say good-bye to what I call a walking encyclopedia. Ray has so much knowledge about so many things in ICANN. And he has used that knowledge so effectively and so generously to advise and guide his fellow board members. And, whenever Ray speaks on the Board -- we all know this -- we all listen because his interventions are always clear and are always insightful.

So, Ray, you're going to leave a huge and big vacuum behind you. Our loss is, of course, the gain of his family. He will now spend more time with Louise, his wife, his children and his grandchildren. And I want you all to stand up and say thank you

to Ray and wish him all the happiness in his next stage of life.
Thank you very much. Ray.

[Applause]

STEVE CROCKER: Ray, I'm going to give you a chance to talk in just a second. But I think both Erika and I want to add a few words.

ERIKA MANN: There's not much more to say about this procedure. I wasn't expecting this order of procedure. But, Ray, I just wanted to say, in addition to what Cherine expressed, you are extremely generous with your time. You helped many new board members who came on the Board and you gave them a lot of advice.

And, on a very personal note -- I think you might laugh about this -- but Ray was helping many members, including me, when we were sitting in board meetings a very long time. He always had nuts in his pocket and in his luggage. You're laughing about this. But, if you would know how long board meetings are sometimes and how we are suffering, he's not just generous. But he is somebody who provides you with good food all the time. Thank you so much, Ray.

RINALIA ABDUL RAHIM: Steve, it's Rinalia. Can I say a word?

STEVE CROCKER: Please do.

RINALIA ABDUL RAHIM: Thank you. I had the deep privilege of succeeding Ray as the chair of the Structural Improvements Committee. And I benefited tremendously from his knowledge, and he was a superb mentor. And I just want to say that he can be as cranky as he likes -- and he's proud of it -- but we are deeply appreciative of him. We will miss him. And he is loved. Thank you, Ray.

[Applause]

STEVE CROCKER: We're going to have a love fest here. Kuo.

KUO-WEI WU: Yeah, I'd like to say something for the Ray. You'll find actually in most of the ICANN meetings in board meetings, I always sit next to him. And you should know why. Actually, Erika say a couple of it. Because Ray really knows how to survive. He came to the ICANN meeting the whole package is including the food, all kind of food. So you sit next to him, you'll have a lot of things to eat.

You're not going to go hungry. You're not going to boring. And, second of all, you know, Ray and I, we don't drink. So most of the time we always try to sit off with the alcohol non-drinking peoples.

And, finally, I like to say another thing. I think it's very important for Ray to keep remind the Board and also the community. Actually, the number community is actually part of ICANN community. But it's very easy for the people to forget the number community is actually part of us. So I think it's very important. And thanks for Ray continued to remind all the number community is a part of us. Thank you very much.

STEVE CROCKER: Thank you. Asha.

ASHA HEMRAJANI: Thank you, Steve. I will speak in Chinese. Ray, I would like to tell you that to me, you're my icon. You're my model. You're my teacher. Thank you so much. You have helped me so much. Thank you.

STEVE CROCKER: Before I turn it over to Ray, I'll just note that I've had the pleasure of working with him since 2002, actually. Ray was the

charter member of the Security Stability Advisory Committee. And I came to chair that at its inception.

And, when we needed to select a vice chair, Ray was clearly the right choice. Spoke his mind no matter what and served as a lode star and a countervailing force sometimes. And always in the most helpful and constructive way.

He also was very generous when he was head of ARIN. Offered facilities whenever we needed a meeting place and was always very supportive. I think he was also a charter member of RSSAC. That put him in pivotal positions at critical times. And he's been helpful just across the entire community.

So you have my personal appreciation. And I think that your exhortations that ICANN should remember that numbers are, in fact, part of our business and that one of the Ns blocks to numbers will echo long after you're gone.

UNKNOWN SPEAKER: (off microphone)

STEVE CROCKER: And that's a very good point. And I'll repeat it, in case somebody didn't -- he's the father of LACNIC. At the time when there were three regional Internet registries -- Asia, North America and

Europe -- two more remained to be formed. And the first of those was in Latin America and Caribbean. And Ray was tireless in helping to bring that into existence.

[Applause]

RAY PLZAK:

Thank you, Steve. First of all, Cherine, the check is in the mail.

[Laughter]

And it's true that I did do a lot of work with the people with Latin America. And also I did have a similar endeavor in Africa as well.

And I will miss all of my friends in those two regions very much.

I don't know. I could say a lot of things, and I won't. One of the things that people tend to do is thank people. And I'm just going to say thanks. I'm not going to mention any names, because that way I won't slight anybody. Just know that the emotion is in my heart.

Wolfgang had some last messages. I'll have some last wishes as a board member. And it's actually one. We need to be kind to each other. We need to respect each other. We don't have anybody else but us. And so every time that we get up and say something, we have to be careful in how we say it in terms of who we are talking to. In a sense, we're talking to us. We have

to remember that no one in this room owns anything. The community owns it. And I'm talking about the broad global community.

We are in a fortunate situation of having been entrusted to take care of that. So, when we are acting in the global public interest, we are exercising a trust that has been given to us. And so we should be careful that we don't squander it.

So we need to treat each other with respect. Remember who we are. Remember there's no one else but us to do this job. And so let's hold on to the trust that we have. Lastly, I want to show you my bag is packed. I'm ready to go. Taxi is waiting, blowing its horn. And so I wish you all the best. I will never forget any one of you, although I'm sure there are some of you that would like to forget me. And so -- with that -- and I know some people thought this day would never come -- I wish you all a fond farewell and godspeed. Thank you very much.

[Applause]

STEVE CROCKER: So the last piece of formality. All in favor?

UNKNOWN SPEAKER: Ayes.

STEVE CROCKER: Any opposed? Any abstentions? We thank you, Ray. That brings this meeting to a close. But it is followed immediately by an organizational meeting of the new board. This is our standard process at an annual general meeting. So let me ask that the departing board members provide room for the incoming board members to come and take their seats.

[END OF TRANSCRIPTION]