
DUBLIN – ccNSO TLD-OPS Steering Committee [C]
Sunday, October 18, 2015 – 15:00 to 16:15 IST
ICANN54 | Dublin, Ireland

CRISTIAN HESSELMAN: Welcome, everybody, to the meeting of the TLD-OPS Standing Committee. My name is Cristian Hesselman. I'm with the Interim Chair of this Standing Committee, and today we have a few guests who are, let's say, from outside the working group, so perhaps we should do a quick [inaudible] to introduce ourselves. Maybe, John, you want—

JOHN CRAIN: I'm John Crain. I'm the chief SSR officer at ICANN. It's kind of related to some of the stuff you're doing. I'm also on the Board of the [inaudible].

SAVE VOCEA: Save Vocea. I'm responsible for Stakeholder Engagement in the Oceania region. That's Pacific Islands, Australia, New Zealand.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: [inaudible] staff.

Note: The following is the output resulting from transcribing an audio file into a word/text document. Although the transcription is largely accurate, in some cases may be incomplete or inaccurate due to inaudible passages and grammatical corrections. It is posted as an aid to the original audio file, but should not be treated as an authoritative record.

RODRIGO DE LA PARRA: Hello. Good afternoon. My name is Rodrigo de la Parra, and I am Vice President for Stakeholder Engagement in Latin America and the Caribbean.

KRISTINA NORDSTROM: Kristina Nordstrom, ccNSO Secretariat.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: [inaudible]. I'm with [inaudible].

DAVID MCAULEY: Hi, everyone. I'll introduce myself. David McAuley with—

CRISTIAN HESSELMAN: —for that introduction. I'm not sure what I do here, but it's like this [inaudible]. So the objectives for today are basically to provide a recap of the TLD-OPS mailing list. What is it, in particular? Because we have folks here at the table who are potentially not very familiar with [it].

So I basically picked up a few slides of the previous ICANN meeting, and put them in this presentation. Then I think we should try to... The goal is to try to explore new outreach

possibilities to further increase the number of subscribers to the TLD-OPS list, and also informally establish the TLD-OPS program [inaudible] Standing Committee.

Finally, we need to agree on a work plan for the [inaudible] until the next ICANN meeting. I'm not sure it's relevant for everyone, but at least for the folks who are on the Standing Committee [inaudible].

So this is the agenda, which derives from the objectives. Of course, I will first give the brief overview of the TLD-OPS initiative, then discuss outreach possibilities with the ICANN VPs, preferably. Strategic planning and use cases; I'm hoping that Patrick Falstrom of the SSAC will also join us at some point, because he might be able to give some input here.

Then continuing on with the formal approval of the Standing Committee, [inaudible] the next ICANN meeting, agree on a work plan, and finally, summarize things we've done so that we can later share it with the community.

So what is the TLD-OPS mailing list? It's actually a basic incident response facility for ccTLDs, but I think it potentially also will work for gTLDs. It acts a ccTLD contact repository. This means that we're using the list to enable ccTLD operators to contact

each other, to find each other's email addresses, phone numbers, and that sort of thing. Names, also.

The folks who are on the list are the people responsible for the security and stability of their ccTLD, so it's really the folks that matter in case of large scale security incidents or large scale availability incidents. And the list is explicitly open to both ccNSO and non-ccNSO members.

What's important is that the list uses a model of personal trust, which means that people that are on the list join with their first name/last name rather than with a role-based account.

The rationale behind it is that we want to facilitate, let's say, the further increase of trust in the ccTLD community, and we think that if people see each other's names, that will help, rather than just seeing, "Okay, this [inaudible] at ccTLD-dot-somewhere. "

And the one thing that we added is a custom [script] and this runs on the [inaudible] server, so it's using a [Mailman] list. The [Mailman] server also runs a script that every month sends an email that contains the full list of members of the list, including phone numbers, e-mail addresses, and that sort of thing.

The rationale behind that is that this will enable people to also [inaudible] list in offline situations. If there's a large scale

security [inaudible], then you might still be able to consult your inbox and go through it.

JOHN CRAIN: [inaudible] changes from in previous week or the previous e-mail that was sent.

CRISTIAN HESSELMAN: Oh, right, yes. Yes.

JOHN CRAIG: But we do something similar with [inaudible] OPS. Are you using v-cards or—

CRISTIAN HESSELMAN: That's something that we had on our road map, I think. We didn't get to it.

JOHN CRAIG: Haven't got to it yet.

CRITIAN HESSELMAN: And also, the approach that we [inaudible] when we developed this, when we set up this system, it was to keep it as simple as

possible so that the whole system would be open to every ccTLD on the planet.

RODRIGO DE LA PARRA: [inaudible] of zero dollar. We've got what we got [inaudible].

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: That helped a lot, too, yes.

CRISTIAN HESSELMAN: So obviously the impact we're trying to achieve here is to further improve the Internet response capabilities of the ccTLD community as a whole. The mailing list was set up by the [inaudible] Working Group. We worked on it for about a year.

So what's the current status? The current status is that we have 139 ccTLDs on the list, ASCII ccTLDs, plus 27 IDNs, so only about 58-59 percent of all ccTLDs out there. And what we would need is...

What we've been doing while we set up the list was actually chase ccTLDs and try to get them to join the list, but I think that, at least from ICANN staff, we've kind of run out of possibilities, so we would like to ask the ICANN VPs to try to help us there. [inaudible].

JOHN CRAIN:

Just one point, and that's why I've not invited all VPs. One of the reasons is if you would look at the distribution, geographic distribution, it's clearly in [inaudible]. Most of the CCs are lacking from your area. We say internally that we ran out of knowledge or contacts with some. We have some very weird ones on that list.

The most interesting one, in my view, is Monaco. Monaco is very difficult to [inaudible], but through all kinds of contacts, Gabi was able to get them on that list, and the same is true for Vatican City. [inaudible] do not play any role within the CENTR Community nor within ICANN. You hardly see them, but they're on this list.

So adding more, and that's probably the most important reason, again, for putting out and putting in extra effort, the more CCs are members of this list the more valuable it becomes. [inaudible] as the starting point of [inaudible] Working Group as well. You can't reach all of them, but if you have 90% of them, that will be great.

CRISTIAN HESSELMAN: That would be great. That's also why we took this very technologically easy approach in order to try to get as many ccTLDs to sign up as possible.

This is the current state of affairs. This is the overview of the TLD-OPS ecosystem. It's a bit of a buzzword, but anyway... On the left there's the ccTLD with what we call the security and stability contacts. These are the folks that are actually on the list, and they get authenticated through the ccTLD's admin contact. This is an interaction with the ICANN staff, who performs that validation, and then once the ICANN staff have authenticated the IANA admin contact as the person responsible for the ccTLD, they will add the security and stability contact of that ccTLD to the list.

JOHN CRAIN: One remark, and that's important for you as well. As you know, Gabi [inaudible]. Kim replaced her, so Kim is sitting in the background. She's now doing the admin part of TLD-OPS.

[inaudible] any questions, [inaudible], from your end, that's the [inaudible]. That's quite [inaudible].

CRISTIAN HESSELMAN: So to the right there's the Working Group. The initial Working Group was [inaudible] the Working Group, and we transferred our responsibilities to the Standing Committee, which [inaudible] continuity that this effort needs, and we also regularly liaise with ISAC and IANA. If there are any questions, just go ahead and stop me.

This is something I copied and pasted from the Working Group's recommendations. The key recommendations of the [inaudible] Working Group were to set up a TLD-OPS Standing Committee – that's what we're doing today – and also to focus on growing the number of ccTLDs on the list for about a year, because the [inaudible] Working Group finished in July, hence June 2016. And also to add contact information that we collect at some point so the IANA database, because Kim Davies indicated one or two ICANNs ago that IANA is reconsidering their contact model to also include things like contact addresses of, let's say, what we call security and stability contacts.

So what are the key challenges? The first one is, of course, it to grow the number of ccTLDs that are subscribed to the list, but also to get the list to be used more often. What we're seeing right now is the list is not being used except by the script that generates these messages every now and then. We would also like to use this meeting to brainstorm or think about potential

uses of that so that it keeps on staying on top of everyone's mind. That concludes the introductory part of this.

In this slide I added two [inaudible] to discuss potential outreach possibilities with you guys to add more ccTLDs to this list. I was wondering if you have thought of any potential ways to do that.

RODRIGO DE LA PARRA: Thank you. Of course we will be happy to help this. I think it would be extremely useful if we could have a very simple [document that] explains what are the benefit for them, for the ccTLDs so that they can [inaudible].

CRISTIAN HESSELMAN: We actually have that document. We made a leaflet, I think, for the BA meeting. Excuse me?

RODRIGO DE LA PARRA: Do you have a copy?

CRISTIAN HESSELMAN: I have it sitting on my laptop somewhere. You want me to show it? There is a website under the ccNSO part of the ICANN site that lists all the ccTLDs that are on it.

We actually also had another leaflet that we handed out in Buenos Aires with the ccTLDs that were not on it.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: [inaudible] have in Africa is that we [inaudible], and still there are issues there. They are too slow to [inaudible]. My point is maybe [inaudible] why won't people really sign their zone? For instance, [inaudible]. But for so many of them, [inaudible] the behavior. Why [inaudible]?

CRISTIAN HESSELMAN: I think the important part is that we enable ccTLDs to tap into the [inaudible], so to speak, and that they can share information on, let's say, security and stability incidents. This works two ways. One is that you as a subscribed TLD can share security incidents with your peers, and also the other way around. You can learn from others what security and stability incidents currently are happening. It works both ways. It might actually help to maybe emphasize [inaudible].

JOHN CRAIN: One of the [inaudible] – I'm on multiple of these lists – ones where even though I get a lot of email, there's actual [inaudible] purely TLD [inaudible] my concerns is that the data won't get

[inaudible]. A lot of the instances [inaudible] that we see don't get noticed necessarily by the CC.

One of my colleagues, one of my group [inaudible] out of that. It might be useful to find a way to push information onto the list, so if we've got these lessons learned [inaudible] maybe there's some way we can package regular [inaudible].

CRISTIAN HESSELMAN: That's a concern of the Group as well. That's also why we listed the second objective is to increase the [inaudible] use of the list, of course. One thing that I think we brainstormed about a while ago is to maybe share information on that list in terms of botnets that are currently active and that might [inaudible]. It's not a trivial task, I would think.

JOHN CRAIN: But it's something that I'd be willing to put my staff's [inaudible] affect the way CCs operate [inaudible].

CRISTIAN HESSELMAN: Okay. That would be great.

ABIBU NTAHIGIYE: [inaudible]in terms of joining the mailing list, but again, there was another issue I encountered. There are some of the CCs which were undergoing [inaudible], and there are some CC representatives for African CCs probably not in their respective countries. So [inaudible] business with Africa. [inaudible] the performance of their registries, but not exactly what they're going to share or they're going to [inaudible].

In that way, they will establish the benefit of being on the [inaudible] outreach. We have a number of events. We have some technical sessions [inaudible]. These are the events where we can share the benefits. [inaudible] event in Africa done by FTLD [inaudible] for the time, maybe. Then I'm [inaudible].

CRISTIAN HESSELMAN: It would help a lot, Abibu. Thanks. That's great.

SAVE VOCEA: [inaudible] the Pacific case, because I think not many of them are also registries. [inaudible] same challenges like that. We have some of the technical functions are run outside, and then also they have roll emails.

You mentioned that you really want names. Some of them might be using Gmail, so what is your notation or your [inaudible] that you want to accept? [inaudible] e-mail with a dot.TLD?

CRISTIAN HESSELMAN: I can respond to that if you want. We've seen these cases before. You're totally right.

We've had a discussion with one ccTLD who refused [inaudible] on the list without a role-based account, and others asked about that, so we basically explained why we took this approach, and most of them, except for this one ccTLD, were okay with that.

In terms of, let's say, Gmail addresses and that sort of thing, we also encounter those, but what we do is we rely on the admin contact. If a guy says, "Okay, my security and stability contacts are these two people," and they have Gmail addresses, then we accept them on the list. There is a risk, of course, that that account gets hacked at some point or [inaudible].

UNIDENTIFIED MALE [inaudible]. There's always staff turnover. Before I even know it, they already moved on to something. They're still in the organization, but [inaudible] you, the maintainer of this list [inaudible]?

CRISTIAN HESSELMAN: We actually don't check that ourselves regularly. What we do is we rely on the responsibility of the TLD operator to notify us.

JOHN CRAIN: So the server code actually can be implemented to allow high amounts of refreshes if people aren't active. That's a process decision you guys have got to go for. There are pro mechanisms inside the code to actually do that by default.

CRISTIAN HESSELMAN: But this is also why we have the TLD-OPS Standing Committee to make decisions whether or not we should [inaudible]. Abibu is referring to a case where there as a ccTLD being re-delegated. Then the question is, "Okay, do we accept the old operator, or do we wait for the new one?" These are the kind of policy decisions that we make in the TLD-OPS Standing Committee.

JOHN CRAIN: [inaudible] reason for creating this Ops Committee. It is [inaudible] driven by ccTLDs.

CRISTIAN HESSELMAN: So your offer, John, would be great to have. Also, I will send you guys the TLD-OPS [inaudible].

JOHN CRAIN: [inaudible] slide around the structure. In order to either say that allows you to survive through this, participate in all the discussions [inaudible] for CCs, and then it's fairly easy to have that discussion [inaudible] have a judgment call by the full group, including you and [inaudible].

RODRIGO DE LA PARRA: [inaudible] to measure is the success of this [inaudible]. We e-mail twice a month to everybody in the [inaudible] in the repository of everybody. E-mail address, name, ccTLD, and phone number, file phone number. And then if there's a security [inaudible] it's a one-to-one.

See, there's [inaudible]. This is happening to you soon. [inaudible], and then we tell them this is happening. All of those communications are not going to be on the mailing [inaudible].

One thing we should ask is if people [inaudible] somebody offline, maybe they just send them a generic e-mail saying, "I ping So-and-so and [inaudible]." It was used or seen instance of people contacting [inaudible].

CRISTIAN HESSELMAN: There's a big registry who [inaudible].

RODRIGO DE LA PARRA: [inaudible].

CRISTIAN HESSELMAN: By the policy [inaudible] the ccTLDs themselves are responsible for finding a contact person for their security and stability. Multiple ccTLDs, in theory, might have the same person responsible for that one, for their security. The list is totally agnostic to this kind of thing.

JOHN CRAIN: The admin contacts of all these, so it's covered from that perspective. It goes back to the individual admin contact, because that's the one that [inaudible].

CRISTIAN HESSELMAN: And it's also the result of, let's say, making things as simple as possible when it comes to technology, so the technology [inaudible] anything like this. All the responsibility for providing this information is with the ccTLDs, and that's also why a mailing list works for this.

RODRIGO DE LA PARRA: And also, it would be very useful to learn... If you have approached them— What has been the main barrier of not [inaudible] that you cannot find the person or [inaudible]? You've been doing some outreach already, right?

ABIBU NTAHIGIYE: [inaudible]. When that e-mail came out, yeah, I was interested to also hear the question. [inaudible] and did subscribe, and they're never involved in any [inaudible].

CRISTIAN HESSELMAN: I know for a fact that it took Gabi a lot of time [inaudible] all these people, so for some of them, they eventually subscribed, but it took multiple rounds of asking them and reminding people and whatever else. So it was quite a lot of effort.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: [inaudible] actually works, then go to the tech [inaudible], then try some of the regional communities.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: [inaudible] from the Oversight Committee, this is far, far the... Yeah. IT's the Middle East.

ABIBU NTAHIGIYE:

You're talking about measuring the [inaudible] for a fact that in the Middle East the majority of the ccTLDs [inaudible]. Now, we do have contact with them. We did work closely with Gabi on trying to onboard more people. Again, as I said, since it's governments who run it, who a GNSO operator [inaudible] would say, "Okay, this is something Western, this is [inaudible]."

One thing we did is that some of the ccTLDs [inaudible] to us about why is this necessary, and [inaudible] global repository has nothing to do with being US-centric. Now, that's one thing. Another thing from actually dealing with [inaudible] is in my region. This wasn't mentioned to me specific, but this is my analysis, my two cents on this.

Some ccTLDs probably opted not to [inaudible] mailing list off the fear that... Let's say you guys who are running this mailing list find some kind of a bug or a black hole in some registry's system, that that operator could be fired because it was somebody external who figured out there was some kind of [inaudible] that fear reaction that if somebody [inaudible] vulnerable, then I might get kicked out of my job. So I think these are [inaudible].

CRISTIAN HESSELMAN: [inaudible], go ahead.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: I think one of the things, if you're really [inaudible] very foolish thought. It was very important to run by DNS OARC, not by ICANN.

ABIBU NTAHIGIYE: That is understood to us. We all understand what is this about. The problem is when you talk to many of the ccTLDs from my region in specific, people won't understand that ICANN staff are more or less like a secretariat who [inaudible]. I guess it's lack of understanding of what ICANN is, how policy develops. "I received this e-mail from an ICANN staff, so this is [inaudible]. Lack of understanding, I would say.

CRISTIAN HESSELMAN: Maybe in terms of... I think another suggestion would be to emphasize somehow that this is not an ICANN initiative, but a global initiative for and by this [inaudible].

JOHN CRAIN: [inaudible], also in your region, is this a [inaudible] function? Is this not a [inaudible]? Have you seen— When you say it's a security mailing list, people [inaudible] and especially [inaudible] —

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: It's an interesting question. You said [inaudible]. As long as they're with one of these groups, and if you [inaudible] it more in a network [inaudible].

ABIBU NTAHIGIYE: Yeah, it might help.

CRISTIAN HESSELMAN: The reason that we did not include any certs is because we wanted to keep it simple. There was a previous working group [inaudible] this issue [inaudible] working group, and their ecosystem was much bigger. At least, my analysis is that things didn't go that well at that point because the group was just too big to handle. That's why we narrowed it down to ccTLD operators initially. I understood what you meant. I was just trying to clarify why we focused on the ccTLD operators.

ABIBU NTAHIGIYE: The idea of certs is good, but the problem is not [inaudible] that actually does cert work... I know a cert in one of these really kind [inaudible] countries in my region where they literally process requests such as "my laptop has a virus on it; how do I clean it?" "My server is not functional; how [inaudible]." In fact, I

just looked at the list. I could see that all the ccTLDs... Let's say all countries who actually have a cert within [inaudible].

CRISTIAN HESSELMAN: Looking at the time, it's a quarter to four. Maybe we should try to move on with the agenda. I wrote down a few suggestions from the discussion.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: Maybe it's...

CRISTIAN HESSELMAN: No, no, no.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: And probably [inaudible].

CRISTIAN HESSELMAN: Abibu?

ABIBU NTAHIGIYE: Just to add on [inaudible], response from the CCs is [inaudible]. Probably it's because of the [inaudible].

CRISTIAN HESSELMAN: Can you explain that? Because I didn't get that.

ABIBU NTAHIGIYE: What I'm saying is most of the CCs do not [inaudible] CC admin and technical contact. In the end we end up saying—

CRISTIAN HESSELMAN: It's a different problem.

ABIBU NTAHIGIYE: [inaudible] different. Now how can deal with the IANA in terms of updating their database?

CRISTIAN HESSELMAN: A question as well is does IANA know how accurate the information in its database is?

ABIBU NTAHIGIYE: I used to work for a CC — sorry about that. Actually I used to operate a ccTLD before I joined ICANN that was dot-[inaudible]. I remember that the IANA would actually send us on an annual basis [inaudible]. That was one good way where they could actually know that [inaudible]. Then I used to communicate a lot

with ICANN staff, which was [inaudible] back then. They actually keep close eyes to us [inaudible].

CRISTIAN HESSELMAN: Or even chat with IANA if they can. I'm not sure they want to do that, but as part of Abibu's suggestion.

RODRIGO DE LA PARRA: Which just reminded me, we moved our corporate offices.

CRISTIAN HESSELMAN: All right. You're off the list, man. I'm kidding.

Considering the time, let's move on to the next part. I had a slide in here, and I was hoping that Patrik Falstrom would be able to join, but he's not here yet.

This is more on strategic... I call it strategic planning. It's more about the use cases for the TLD-OPS list. We already discussed this, actually, as part of the previous discussion. I think that ICANN providing this kind of information packaging would be great.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: [inaudible].

CRISTIAN HESSELMAN: Yeah, yeah, I understand that. White label information, that's great. Thanks.

Unless there are any other ideas at this point, I think maybe we should carry on. What do you guys think?

JOHN CRAIN: I think you've already answered this question already. On other, similar lists, the other use case, it sounds like you've not seen any of that yet.

RODRIGO DE LA PARRA: The difference is that [inaudible] the full list of 394 [inaudible] all the time.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: Yeah, on the other list they [inaudible].

CRISTIAN HESSELMAN: Yeah. We also took a conscious decision to focus on the contact repository part in distributing the contact information and actually trying to not so much encourage people to share actual incident information on the list, because the list is unencrypted.

It also was a conscious decision because we wanted to make the entry barrier as low as possible. So there are different design decisions that influence each other.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: Is there a practical way of maybe moving this? I wonder whether there's something that even [inaudible] responsibilities at some point [inaudible]. Okay, we had the hopes that someone [inaudible].

CRISTIAN HESSELMAN: I'm not sure if I got your point, to be honest.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: My point is to [inaudible].

CRISTIAN HESSELMAN: Okay, yeah, that won't make sense.

JOHN CRAIN: And we do have [inaudible].

CRISTIAN HESSELMAN: Yeah, that's [inaudible]. He's with TW. But it might make sense to also, let's say, have a region Middle East, because my gut feeling here is that also the way to approach people might be different on a per-region basis, and you guys know the folks you're talking to best. So if you're willing to help out in the Middle East, you know an approach that would work specifically for the Middle East, that would be great.

I would not necessarily divide it into the regions that we have. If there are sub-regions that we must [inaudible] specifically, then that would be very good, too.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: To make the link between—

ABIBU NTAHIGIYE: [inaudible] after we conclude the [inaudible], those ccTLDs who are [inaudible]—

CRISTIAN HESSELMAN: Yeah, that would be awesome.

ABIBU NTAHIGIYE: [inaudible].

CRISTIAN HESSELMAN: My personal view is that will be the best approach, a personal approach, to just call people [inaudible], explain that all. I think that will work best.

ABIBU NTAHIGIYE: I'll explain to them.

CRISTIAN HESSELMAN: And explain. Right.

ABIBU NTAHIGIYE: I'll do that. I worked with Gabi on [inaudible] region, and I still have those e--mails.

CRISTIAN HESSELMAN: Thank you. All right, let's move on. Now, we get to the part... We still need to formalize the members of the Standing Committee. We have [Elise]. We have Jacques. We have Erwin and Ali joining the TLD-OPS committee. Jacques is with .ca, Erwin with Denmark, and Ali is with the Faroe Islands. Then we have Federico and [inaudible] and Abibu still unconfirmed, but maybe... Oh, okay, so we also have Abibu on the committee. That's great. Thanks, Abibu. It's great to have you.

I also put myself up as an interim Chair because I thought I was not necessarily the one to lead this effort, so I asked the group, and they thought, "Okay, why don't you do it?" I'm willing to further chair this Standing Committee by now, so I will just remove the word "interim" there if it's all okay with you guys.

ABIBU NTAHIGIYE: [inaudible].

CRISTIAN HESSELMAN: Yeah, thanks. So let me take an action point to ping [Gangda] and Federico again, because they haven't responded yet.

And now objectives until ICANN 55. [inaudible] here has tried to come up with a few draft objectives. The first one, of course, is to grow the number of members, so I thought maybe an objective would be to get another 25 ccTLDs on the list, which would bring us up to around 165. But of course we heavily rely there on efforts by the VP, for example. I think that by targeting by specific ccTLDs/regions is something that we just discussed, right? We'll be sending you guys this information. You'll be calling your members in the Middle East, so that'll be great.

Get the list to be used more often. You've already stepped up for that, so that's also a thing that we can check off, I think. And

then we need to replace the interim members of the Committee. I will check with [Gangda] and Fred if they're still available. If they're not, we need to find other people for the LAC region for the Asia-Pacific region. Any additional comments on this line?

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: [inaudible] the liaison with SSR and SSAC [inaudible] the charter includes it. It's more question of, say, having a dedicated person from your team [inaudible]. So if it's you, we'll subscribe you to the e-mail list, and then it makes communication far more [inaudible].

CRISTIAN HESSELMAN: A subscription to the Standing Committee list?

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: Yeah.

CRISTIAN HESSELMAN: There's also the TLD-OPS Incident Response list itself. Thanks for the reminder. I forgot that.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: Yeah, but having somebody [inaudible]. We'll do. We'll send him an e-mail.

CRISTIAN HESSELMAN: So, what I can do to send Patrik an e-mail to ask or maybe meet up with him later on during the [inaudible].

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: [inaudible] group very [inaudible], knowing me and you have an easy way of moving forward.

CRISTIAN HESSELMAN: Yep.

ABIBU NTAHIGIYE: You say here in the slide ASCII ccTLDs. What about [inaudible].

CRISTIAN HESSELMAN: Yeah, that's a good point.

ABIBU NTAHIGIYE: I can remember that it's on the list on the website that [inaudible] TLD.

CRISTIAN HESSELMAN: It's both. You're right. That's a good point.

ABIBU NTAHIGIYE: And actually, I have IDN ccTLDs in my region. Actually, all IDN ccTLDs are run by [inaudible].

CRISTIAN HESSELMAN: Oh, really?

ABIBU NTAHIGIYE: Yes, so I was kind of wondering [inaudible]—

CRISTIAN HESSELMAN: I was unaware of that.

ABIBU NTAHIGIYE: Okay, so [inaudible].

CRISTIAN HESSELMAN: Yeah, that would be helpful.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: Send it to [inaudible], and he and I will forward it.

CRISTIAN HESSELMAN: We don't read Arabic very well, so we miss on that.

I think that this is what we'll need to do until the next ICANN meeting. We'll see. We'll evaluate in Marrakech how far we got. So the work plan – I don't think that we need to spell this [inaudible] in a very detailed level. I think we've already identified the number of action points that we need to just set in motion

I think that basically ends our meeting at this point unless there's people who want to ask a few questions or provide feedback at this point, but I think we already had substantive, relevant matters here. So with that, I would like to thank everyone for attending, especially the ICANN VPs and John, who are not on the TLD Standing Committee, but took the time to contribute here. It's highly valuable. Thank you very much. We'll keep you posted on our progress, and hopefully meet you again in Marrakech.

[END OF TRANSCRIPTION]